1. Descriptive Information

Plenary Session 2: Transforming the Workforce for Children Birth through Age 8: State Approaches to Increasing Workforce Qualifications
The *Transforming the Workforce for Children Birth Through Age 8: A Unifying Foundation* report (Institute of Medicine/National Research Council, 2015) proposed large-scale changes to the early childhood workforce by improving and transforming professional development systems. With leadership from the National Academy of Medicine, eight States have begun a collaborative process for implementation planning to address the recommendations outlined in the Transforming the Workforce report. In this plenary session, attendees will hear experiences from two States—Minnesota and California—as they plan to implement the report’s recommendations. Presentations will be followed by a moderated question-and-answer segment, where panelists will reflect on the most effective strategies, biggest hurdles, and areas of overlap among programs and stakeholders (e.g., CCDF program, prekindergarten [preK] programs, Early Head Start – Child Care Partnerships [EHS-CCP], Head Start).

Facilitator
Mallory Warner-Richter, Child Trends

Panelists
- Kimber Bogard, National Academy of Medicine | *Transforming the Workforce Report: Pathways to Implementation*
- Caitlin Lawrence-Toombs, Glen Price Group, and Justina Acevedo-Cross, David and Lucile Packard Foundation | *Implementation Plan for the State of California*
- Christa Anders, Advance Consulting, and Erin Imon Gavin, McKnight Foundation | *Implementation Plan for the State of Minnesota*

Scribe
Anne Partika, Child Trends

2. Documents in Session Folder:
   a. Slides will be made available on Research Connections

3. Brief Summary of Presentations
   - **Introduction**
     *Mallory Warner-Richter, Child Trends*
     Through the National Survey for Early Care and Education (NSECE), we learned that just under half of center-based teachers and caregivers serving pre-k age children have bachelor’s degrees. For center-based teachers and caregivers serving infants and toddler, 1 in 5 have bachelor’s degrees. Around 1 in 6 homebased providers have a bachelor’s degree. This information has implications for how we engage providers and for how they interact with parents and families.
   
   - **Transforming the Workforce Report: Pathways to Implementation**
     *Kimber Bogard, National Academy of Medicine*
     - The National Academy of Medicine’s *Committee on the Science of Children Birth to Age 8* developed a graphic to show the interrelatedness of all of the recommendations in the report. In order for these changes to be successful, there needs to be coordination between different systems.
     - Next, they convened five states – CA, WA, IL, DC, VA. The work in each state was funded by a different philanthropic foundation. These states submitted their implementation plans in September and are currently working on the early stages of implementation. For implementation, they worked to take this set of interrelated, very complex recommendations and transfer it to implementation. To develop pathways to bachelor’s degrees for the ECE workforce, there are many interrelated and important government branches and policies that need to be addressed. Round 2 set of states included MN, NE, and CO. Their implementation plans are due in late May/early June.
     - Additionally, national organizations came together to support the states and network to make sure the right organizations are answering the correct questions from the states. Additionally, they are now working on a paper.
     - Next steps: Round 3 states will be launching around June. While we won’t reach all states, at what point do we have enough states that everyone is working towards improving the workforce?
Implementation Plan for the State of California
Caitlin Lawrence-Toombs, Glen Price Group, and Justina Acevedo-Cross, David and Lucile Packard Foundation

- California context:
  - 12.5% of the nation’s children live in California
  - In 2006, California had 3M children ages 0-5
  - 61% of children are in households where all parents work
  - 26% of children are in low income families
  - 60% of children birth to 5 are dual-language learners
  - Over 107,000 people are in the ECE workforce in California
  - There are 145 higher education institutes in California that serve ECE workforce education

- A group was co-convened by First 5 California and the California Department of Education, Early Education and Support Division. They were tasked with prioritizing and creating a space to be more intentional about aligning various initiatives in the states. They wanted to honor the work that existed but also plan to coordinate support for all of these different efforts. California’s planning process considered recommendations from the IOM and NRC report, as well as other relevant reports to learn how the workforce should be supported. This helped to get them to a good point around prioritizations and to realize realistic possibilities. The end goal is the high quality education for children in ECE.

- Implementation Plan
  - Plan structure included various priority areas with recommendations, timelines, suggested partners and objectives. The Action Planning team included workgroups addressing each of the following priority areas:
    - **Permitting and credentialing:**
      - Developing appropriate certification standards
      - Establishing a statewide system of support for professional development providers
      - Strengthening preparation programs to help candidates meet certification standards
    - **Professional pathways:**
      - Developing a career lattice for the early childhood workforce, building on previous efforts
      - Identifying challenges to career advancement, and solutions to those challenges
      - Increasing use of the California ECE Workforce Registry in order to more effectively track workforce progress & answer key questions about the workforce
    - **Higher education and ongoing professional learning**
      - Identifying the needs of and ways to support degree-granting institutions
      - Aligning training programs with new certification standards and supporting faculty and administrators to develop and revise programs accordingly
      - Building a cross-disciplinary degree program for early childhood workforce leaders
      - Supporting institutional infrastructure such as field placement sites
      - Implementation structure – They’re in the early stages
    - Visit Twb8-CA.net for more information on the plan and sign up for their newsletter.

Implementation Plan for the State of Minnesota
Christa Anders, Advance Consulting, and Erin Imon Gavin, McKnight Foundation

- Minnesota context:
  - Unlike CA, MN has about 700,000 children ages 0-9
  - 1 in 5 are dual-language learners
  - 7% of white children in poverty; ~39% of children of color in poverty
  - There are 35,000 childcare workers in MN
  - Most centers are located in the urban areas
• MN lost 30% of family providers since 2005
• K-12 teacher attrition is up 34% in <10 years
• Average provider salary is 10.81 per hour
• Most providers do not have bachelor’s degrees
• Most providers are white women

○ How did we get involved?
  • Since 2008, the P-3 Design Team is a learning community and debates and comes to consensus around policy issues. Despite challenges, the team recommended that Minnesota should support early childhood educators in accessing pathways to higher education and credentials, including a content-specific BA degree, but should not require a BA at this time.
  • B8 Workforce and National Academies
    • If we’re going to place the burden on the system to create pathways to higher education and credentials, then the state would need support. Therefore, McKnight supported the work and hired Christa to facilitate. The structured core team to include representatives from higher education, state agencies, greater Minnesota, and advocates who work with both communities and ECE providers.

○ Minnesota’s priorities:
  i. Recommendation #5 Develop and Enhance Minnesota’s Institutes of Early Childhood Higher Education
    • Create a collaborative and unified statewide system to map programs, matriculate 2 year programs to 4 year programs, provide online options, and recruit and retain diverse students so that the workforce will better match the students
    • Recruit early childhood educators with MA or PhD to teach
  ii. Comprehensive pathways to higher education and credentials, including a Bachelor’s degree
    • Both immediately after high school and later in life
  iii. Quality field placements, including student teaching and induction supports
    • Supporting both students and employers
  iv. Collect and use early childhood workforce data to inform stakeholders and policy decisions
    • Using the Early Childhood Longitudinal Data Systems (ECLDS) and Develop (workforce registry)

○ Next steps:
  • Who owns this work? Government, philanthropy, advocacy organizations?
  • How do you sequence and prioritize?
  • Will Minnesota really invest in this?
  • They are optimistic about Minnesota’s priorities and plans and hope that we find more links between ECE workforce and child outcomes

4. Brief Summary of Discussion

• What is the National Academy of Medicine’s role in helping this to move forward beyond Round 3?
  o Kimber noted that while the National Academy of Medicine is most known for recommendation studies, they also play the role of neutral convener. They have 20-25 forums with roundtables, workshops, and action collaboratives. They saw a need to bring the field together around the Transforming the Workforce report. Regarding next steps after Round 3, she said that she’s not sure will happen. She didn’t really expect there to even be a Round 2. However, they plan to continue to network state teams as they come together and learn about challenges, solutions, and ongoing research.

• What unique contributions can philanthropy make? Do you have a role beyond convening?
  o Justina shared that Packard is working on a new 10-year strategy to focus on Pre-k. When thinking about the goals of making sure children are healthy and ready for school, they realized that an important factor is the adults in children lives. One advantage of foundation work is that a philanthropic organization can take a 10-year, long-term view on an issue, which leads to flexibility in the approach that can be taken over time. When things seem too risky for the state of California
to take on, philanthropy can step in and take that risk. Additionally, as outsiders, philanthropic organizations can play a catalytic role with research and development of implementation.

- Erin seconded Justina’s statement. Additionally, she stated that McKnight would be jeopardizing our investments in access and alignment if we weren’t addressing the gaps – both quality and numbers gaps – in the ECE workforce. Philanthropic organizations have the flexibility to step into gaps and support new areas. To transform the workforce on the necessary scale, the government needs to be involved. However, philanthropic organizations can help facilitate forward movement.

- For the states: Any lessons learned or advice for other states starting the implementation process?
  - Caitlin noted that gathering support from a broader group of stakeholders is important, but it’s important to be clear on how everyone in the diverse group fits in. Additionally, having a timeline that is flexible is important.
  - Christa noted that, once you get enough of the right people talking about a new idea, you get a tipping point. However, it’s not sure what comes first – finding the right people and having them select the recommendations to focus on, or selecting the focal recommendations and then finding the right people to work on them. Additionally, she noted that implementation is a lot of work, so expanding staff and support may be need. She also noted that it’s important to consider both workforce qualifications and workforce well-being. Finally, she noted that they had an easier time convincing legislators when they framed ECE workforce development as an economic development issue and not a women’s issue.

- To conclude, Mallory asked the audience to reflect on their roles researchers in this area.

5. Summary of Key issues raised:
- State and philanthropic organizations have been working together to implement these changes. Moving forward, who is most suited to implement these changes? What unique strengths does each sector bring?
- Where is the tipping point at which all states will make these changes?