Early Childhood Education Decision-Making among Latinx Foreign-born Parents

DEVELOPING A CULTURALLY-INFORMED MODEL

CCEPPRC ANNUAL MEETING 2019
KEVIN FERREIRA VAN LEER, CALIFORNIA STATE UNIVERSITY, SACRAMENTO
Latinx Migrant Families

1 in 8 children in the US have a Latino immigrant parent as of 2013

Community Contexts
◦ Majority live in two parent households
◦ Disproportionately live in neighborhoods of concentrated poverty
◦ Disproportionately live in crowded housing
◦ Bilingual
◦ Lower health insurance coverage

Trends
◦ Although the gap is narrowing, Latinx children are more likely to drop-out or not attend college than their white counterparts

Sources: Murphey, Guzman & Torres (2014); Fuller & Garcia-Coll (2010); Clarke, Turner & Guzman (2017)
High Quality Center-Based Early Childhood Education (ECE)

Long-Term Benefits
- Higher High School Graduation rates
- Greater Years of Education completed
- Greater Earnings
- Reduced Crime
- Reduced Pregnancy during teenage years

Cost-Effective Intervention
- Estimates range from a 3:1 to 7:1 saved to cost ratio

High Quality ECE is often associated with Center-based care

Findings suggest center-based care is more beneficial on math, reading & language outcomes for children in immigrant families compared to native-born families

Research on the Tulsa and Boston preschool programs found large benefits for Latinos

Source: Bumgarner & Lin (2014), Votruba-Drzal et al. (2015); Yoshikawa et al. (2013)
ECE Outcomes for Latinx & Migrant Children

Findings suggest center-based care is more beneficial for children in immigrant families compared to native-born families.

Compared to other childcare settings, Center-based Care:

- Increased Reading & Language Skills
- Greater Math Development
- Decreased Externalizing Behaviors

Sources: Bumgarner & Lin (2014), Votruba-Drzal et al. (2015)
The Dilemma

High quality early childhood education is a cost-effective, empirically supported intervention that may mitigate negative outcomes common to the contexts children from Latino immigrant families find themselves in.

Yet, Latino immigrant families utilize high quality center-based early childhood education settings at rates lower than other racial and ethnic groups.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Latino</th>
<th>White</th>
<th>Black</th>
<th>Asian/Pacific Islander</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Parental Care</td>
<td>24.3</td>
<td>18.5</td>
<td>15.3</td>
<td>19.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Center-based Care</td>
<td>52.9</td>
<td>58.5</td>
<td>65.3</td>
<td>67.0</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table modified from: Rathbun & Zhang, 2016
Accommodation Model

Family decisions about childcare are “accommodation” to the competing demands within their contexts, available information and resources as well as social and cultural norms.

Sources: Meyers and Jordan (2006), Chaundry, Henly & Meyers (2010); Weber (2011)
Research Design

This project was part of a larger, transformative mixed methods design.

**Aim**: Better understand the ECE decision-making process of Latino foreign-born parents with children ages 3 to 5 through an examination of the accommodation model to develop a culturally informed model that delineates how family characteristics, community characteristics, parental preferences and perceived opportunities and constraints relate to ECE selection for this population.
Research Design

This project was part of a larger, transformative mixed methods design.

Aim: Better understand the ECE decision-making process of Latino foreign-born parents with children ages 3 to 5 through an examination of the accommodation model to develop a culturally informed model that delineates how family characteristics, community characteristics, parental preferences and perceived opportunities and constraints relate to ECE selection for this population.
Phase 1
Methods

◦ 4 communities
  ◦ Communities varied by community language use & availability of care settings

◦ Group interviews
  ◦ Open-ended questions
  ◦ Two stimuli activities
    ◦ Ranking activity
    ◦ Vignettes

◦ Analysis
  ◦ Informed by thematic coding & grounded theory
  ◦ Line-by-line inductive coding condensed into axial codes
  ◦ Deductive coding to compare axial codes to accommodation model
  ◦ Conceptual memos
Sample: Participant Characteristics

- 22 parents from 18 families
  - Three fourths were mothers or female primary guardians
  - Ranged from 19 to 50 years old
  - Variety of formal education
  - Half reported being currently employed

- Immigrant characteristics
  - All spoke Spanish with half reporting speaking another language
  - Six countries represented
  - Half resided in the U.S. for over 10 years

- Primary ECE use
  - 4 used Parental Care; 5 used Home-based Care; 9 used Center-based Care
Beliefs about Development & Parental Goals

- “A mother’s care is best”
  - “No, lo ideal es cuidar uno a sus propios hijos, porque cuando uno da los hijos [a otra persona] a cuidar, no se lo cuidan como uno... Lo ideal es cuidar uno a los propios hijos.”

- “Children are recording”

- Education once appropriate

- Maintaining Language
“Cara vemos, corazon no sabemos”/ Trusting Providers

“The best, if I cannot care for my child, is my mother. Who can take better care of my child than my mom? Because others, ‘cara vemos, corazon no sabemos’ [we see their face, but we don’t know their heart].”

- Protection from maltreatment & danger

- Character & Preparation
  - “You need to know the people that you leave your children with well, what are their thoughts, whether they are a good or bad person.”

- Cariño & Responsiveness
Understanding of ECE

- Perceptions of ECE choices
  - “In Colombia, the children go to “infantgarten” since they are two years old. It isn’t all day, it is only a couple of hours, and people are used to it, so they take care of their children or the grandmother does, but they go to a couple of hours of that structure where they are singing, playing and doing whatever. Well, they are teaching them their letters, the vowels, but it is more the structure where they are starting to socialize among themselves. So, it is a habit.”

- Knowledge of local options
Perceived Context of Reception

- Discrimination & Racism
  - “That, it’s like racism. Because if you have done the evaluations, and your son is already registered, it isn’t necessary to present the paperwork…”
  - “What if there are racist teachers?”

- Perceptions of the political climate
Informed Preferences

- ECE type and schedule

- Provider capacity
  - “Apart from having good references, [I picked it] because that school teaches children how to speak. If they don’t know how to speak, they teach them how to speak... that is the difference, they offer those services.”

- Safety
Evaluating Care

- References
- Direct engagement
- Learning to become an advocate
Opportunities & Constraints

◦ Maternal Employment
  ◦ “Well, if someone works, they’ll leave their child in daycare, but if a woman doesn’t work they take care of their children.”
  ◦ “Her mother is caring for her now... but, maybe, if she goes to work one day my mother-in-law can take care of her.”

◦ Perception of child’s development
  ◦ “I haven’t even started to look at [preschool options] yet, but he is asking for it. But I just don’t like the idea of putting him in something that is going to force me to do it full time. Like, I don’t even know what time they start, but like 9 to 3 I think is excessive.”
Beliefs about Development & Parental Goals
- “A mother’s care is best”
- “Children are recording”
- Education once appropriate
- Maintaining Language

Opportunities & Constraints
- Maternal employment
- Perception of child’s development

Perceived Context of Reception
- Discrimination & racism
- Perceptions of the political climate

“Cara vemos, corazon no sabemos” / Trusting Providers
- Protection from maltreatment & danger
- Character & preparation
- Carino & responsiveness

Understanding of ECE
- Perceptions of ECE choices
- Knowledge of local options

Informed Preferences
- ECE type and schedule
- Provider capacity
- Safety

Evaluating Care
- References
- Direct engagement
- Learning to become an advocate

ECE Selection

Perceived Context of Reception

Understanding of ECE

Informed Preferences

Evaluating Care

ECE Selection

“Cara vemos, corazon no sabemos” / Trusting Providers

Beliefs about Development & Parental Goals

Opportunities & Constraints
Comparison to the Accommodation Model
Conclusions
Role of Parental Beliefs & Socialization Goals

- Extends literature on the relationship between beliefs and socialization goals and ECE selection
  - E.g. “Bien educado” & desire for a good role model

- Demonstrates how the role of relational values common to Latino families manifests within the ECE decision-making process

Sources: Denmark, Harden & Gonzalez, 2014; Durand, 2011
Cultural Niche

- ECE decision-making process was yoked to their immigrant experience

- Cultural and Structural elements as intertwined

Sources: Brandon, 2004; Garcia-Coll et al. (1996); Hernandez, Nancy & Macartney, 2011; Miller & Votruba-Drzal, 2013; Vesely, 2013
Limitations

- Small sample size
- Transferability
- Findings are descriptive, not causal
Implications

Field & Policy
- Consistent & clear language
- Provide more culturally responsive care & increase communication with families
- Amplify child care resource & referral agencies or investment in other mechanisms to spread information to families
- Adapt quality rating systems to mirror those concerns of families
- Awareness of larger political climate’s influence on ECE decision-making

Research
- Greater attention to cultural contexts of decisions
- Greater examination of the relationship between parental beliefs and socialization goals on ECE decision-making
- Continue to investigate the interplays of cultural & structural considerations on ECE decision-making
Thank You

Gracias

k.ferreiravanleer@csus.edu
Sample: Primary ECE Use with Language Used

- **Parental**
  - Spanish Only: 3
  - Spanish & English: 1
  - English Only: 1
  - Spanish & Mixteco: 2
  - No Report: 0

- **Home-based**
  - Spanish Only: 1
  - Spanish & English: 1
  - English Only: 1
  - Spanish & Mixteco: 1
  - No Report: 1

- **Center-based**
  - Spanish Only: 1
  - Spanish & English: 4
  - English Only: 1
  - Spanish & Mixteco: 1
  - No Report: 3
Phase 1: Research Questions

1. How do Latino foreign-born parents with children ages 3-5 describe their decision making process, as related to the accommodation model?

2. How do Latino foreign-born parents with children ages 3-5 parents describe their preferences and beliefs about early childhood care and education, and perceived opportunities and constraints in selecting ECE?
Sampling & Recruitment

Four communities will be chosen using a maximum variation strategy
  ◦ Availability of ECE
  ◦ Community-language use

Recruited through community centers, cultural organizations, religious institutions, health clinics
  ◦ Convenience and snowball sampling;
  ◦ Maximum variation of participants by utilization of ECE settings
Procedure

Focus Groups
- Informed Consent were be obtained
- Demographics questionnaire
- Open-ended topic-guide
  - Themes included: parental beliefs about parenting and care, preferences for care, opportunities and constraints and previous ECE selection experiences

Data collection methods:
- Recorded
- Notes will be taken during the focus groups
- Field notes on body language, tone and other highlights will be taken directly after

Workshops on bilingual language development in selected communities
Analytic Technique

Thematic coding using deductive categories from accommodations model
- Open to emergent themes
- Grounded-theory informed

Conceptual Memoing

Utilizing Nvivo 11 software
Beliefs about Development & Parental Goals

- “A mother’s care is best”
  - “No, lo ideal es cuidar uno a sus propios hijos, porque cuando uno da los hijos [a otra persona] a cuidar, no se lo cuidan como uno... Lo ideal es cuidar uno a los propios hijos.”
  - “Well, one should take care of their children because no one else can take care of them the same way.”

- “Children are recording”
  - “They record, record, record everything and when they are grown, they already know. That’s it, that’s how I teach my daughter.”

- Education once appropriate
  - “They should go to school when they are 5 years old”
  - “Yes, at three years old they should go to school, and I think it is really good for them because they teach them various things.”
  - “Nine to three I think is excessive,” and another mother, Liliana, worrying “it is the large amount of time for them, at that young age, that at times I think it is counterproductive.”

- Maintaining Language
  - “Bueno, mi hijo solamente está aprendiendo inglés... quiero que aprenda español, pero, es que no se, porque solamente está hablando ingles y me entiende español, el me entiende cuando yo hablo, pero el no quiere hablar español, no sé por qué. Tiene tres años y en la escuela donde esta es puro inglés.”
“Cara vemos, corazon no sabemos”/ Trusting Providers

“The best, if I cannot care for my child, is my mother. Who can take better care of my child than my mom? Because others, ‘cara vemos, corazon no sabemos’ [we see their face, but we don’t know their heart].”

◦ Protection from maltreatment & danger
  ◦ “If you don’t take care of your own children, you don’t know what will happen if you leave them with a babysitter or a daycare. When he was born, never a babysitter, there are babysitters who hit children, who care for five, six children. I don’t want that to happen.”

◦ Character & Preparation
  ◦ “You need to know the people that you leave your children with well, what are their thoughts, whether they are a good or bad person.”
  ◦ “I would say that I would look for, apart from qualities, is vocation because everyone has a vocation. There are people who like children, and those who because of necessity care for children, but that is not the type of person I look for.”

◦ Cariño & Responsiveness
Understanding of ECE

- Perceptions of ECE choices
  - “In Colombia, the children go to “infantgarten” since they are two years old. It isn’t all day, it is only a couple of hours, and people are used to it, so they take care of their children or the grandmother does, but they go to a couple of hours of that structure where they are singing, playing and doing whatever. Well, they are teaching them their letters, the vowels, but it is more the structure where they are starting to socialize among themselves. So, it is a habit.”

- Knowledge of local options
  - “Because he was going to go to the same place my daughter went but they sent him to another school because they did not accept him there... and in that school it is pure English, in the other one was in Spanish. That is why I am not very happy.”
Perceived Context of Reception

- **Discrimination & Racism**
  - That, it’s like racism. Because if you have done the evaluations, and your son is already registered, it isn’t necessary to present the paperwork...“My children, I have them in school and they don’t kick out my children because I didn’t come back for the paperwork. If he was supposed to be enrolled in two weeks, in two weeks bring the paperwork, but he is already enrolled.”
  - “What if there are racist teachers?”

- **Perceptions of the political climate**
  - “Because I don’t want problems. Sometimes they ask on the news, whether someone has fifteen years here, four years here.”
Informed Preferences

- ECE type and schedule

- Provider capacity
  - “Apart from having good references, [I picked it] because that school teaches children how to speak. If they don’t know how to speak, they teach them how to speak... that is the difference, they offer those services.”

- Safety
Evaluating Care

- References
  - “...that it had references from other people about how good of a school it was, how safe it was, all of that. References to see if one should take their children there or not.”

- Direct engagement
  - “I knew this woman for many years and saw her children since they were little. I mean, I knew that her children were well taken care of, happy, calm... you don’t see,” “-you don’t see bad traits in those children”
  - “Si [uno tiene que conocerlos] porque cuando les hacen las evaluaciones, uno esta presente, no deja a los hijos con las personas. Uno esta presente y ver como es que tratan a los demás niños porque hay niños y cuando los están formando, cualquier cosa, uno mismo se fija como esta esa persona.”
  - “To know them and see how they are making progress, because my daughter has difficulties in learning to speak, well both of my children, my son and my daughter had difficulties learning how to speak, and, well, that is what they teach. Asking [teachers] how they [my children] are doing.”

- Learning to become an advocate
  - “But teachers will never do that. You, yourself, have to call them and ask how your child is behaving, or if you go to pick up your child ask the teacher. They may say that they are sick of you, but you have to ask about your children.”
Opportunities & Constraints

◦ Maternal Employment
  ◦ “Well, if someone works, they’ll leave their child in daycare, but if a woman doesn’t work they take care of their children.”
  ◦ “Her mother is caring for her now... but, maybe, if she goes to work one day my mother-in-law can take care of her.”

◦ Perception of child’s development
  ◦ “I haven’t even started to look at [preschool options] yet, but he is asking for it. But I just don’t like the idea of putting him in something that is going to force me to do it full time. Like, I don’t even know what time they start, but like 9 to 3 I think is excessive.”