Do State CCDF Policy Guidelines Differentially Affect Hispanic Families’ Access and Utilization?

A Seven State Scan

Zoelene Hill, Research Fellow
Collaborators: Lisa Gennetian, Julia Mendez Smith, Danielle Crosby, and Lina Guzman
National Research Center on Hispanic Children & Families
Presentation Outline

1. Background on CCDF and CCDF Utilization
2. Guiding Question
3. Methods
4. Findings from State Policy Scan
Background on CCDF

• The Child Care and Development Fund (CCDF) is the primary federal program devoted to providing low-income working families with a child care subsidy.

• The federal government distributes money to States. States (and counties) establish their own policy guidelines for distributing subsidies.

• Funds are distributed through certificates (vouchers) or grants and contracts with providers to subsidize child care.
Who uses CCDF?

• Approximately 8.6 million children are in families that are eligible to receive CCDF (GAO, 2016)

• CCDF served approximately 1.4 million children in (GAO, 2016)

• Compared to the eligible population, children served are:
  • Younger (66% are under age 5)
  • From families with lower levels of income
  • Less likely to be Hispanic
Hispanic Families’ Use of CCDF

• GAO found that in 23 of 44 states examined, the percentage of Hispanic children served by CCDF was lower than the percentage of children who would be eligible (GAO, 2016)

• This was true in all but one state, New Mexico (GAO, 2016)
Guiding Question

Do state CCDF policy guidelines differentially affect Hispanic families’ access and utilization?
Selecting States

- Large Hispanic Population (#, %, Growth)
- Regional Diversity

**States**
1. Arkansas
2. California
3. Illinois
4. New York
5. New Mexico
6. North Carolina
7. Texas
Table 1: Percent Income-Eligible (Irrespective of Work Status) Hispanic vs. Percent Served Hispanic, 2014

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Income-Eligible</th>
<th>Served</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arkansas‡‡</td>
<td>0.1</td>
<td>0.2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>California‡‡</td>
<td>0.7</td>
<td>0.6</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Illinois</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New Mexico‡‡</td>
<td>0.9</td>
<td>0.8</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>New York</td>
<td>0.3</td>
<td>0.4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North Carolina‡‡</td>
<td>0.2</td>
<td>0.3</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Texas‡‡</td>
<td>0.8</td>
<td>0.7</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

‡ indicates state policy includes waiting list procedure
‡‡ families on waitlist in 2016
Data Sources

1. Urban Institute Policy Inventory
2. State Policy Manuals
3. Investigation of the online user experience
Types of Policy Guidelines Set by States that May Matter for Hispanic Families

- Eligibility Guidelines
  - How is work defined?
  - How is family defined?
  - Income cut-offs
- Documentation Guidelines
  - What documents must applicant provide?
  - What information does application solicit?
- Priority Guidelines
  - Which groups of families are given priority in instances of fund shortage?
## Sample of CCDF Policy Guideline Variation by State

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>State</th>
<th>Arkansas</th>
<th>California</th>
<th>Illinois</th>
<th>New York</th>
<th>New Mexico</th>
<th>North Carolina</th>
<th>Texas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Is ESL an Approved Activity?</strong></td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Priority Given to TANF Recipients?</strong></td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Sample of CCDF Policy Guideline Variation by State

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Arkansas</th>
<th>California</th>
<th>Illinois</th>
<th>New York</th>
<th>New Mexico</th>
<th>North Carolina</th>
<th>Texas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Is ESL an Approved Activity?</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Priority Given to TANF Recipients?</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>YES</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Guideline may facilitate utilization by Hispanic families
- Guideline may constrain utilization by Hispanic families
## Sample of CCDF Policy Guideline Variation by State

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Work Hour Requirements</th>
<th>Arkansas</th>
<th>California</th>
<th>Illinois</th>
<th>New York</th>
<th>New Mexico</th>
<th>North Carolina</th>
<th>Texas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>30 hrs/ adult in HH</td>
<td>30 hrs/ adult in HH</td>
<td>No Minimum</td>
<td>No Minimum</td>
<td>No minimum (Hours of subsidized care tied to hours of work)</td>
<td>5 hrs/month</td>
<td>No Minimum</td>
<td>25hrs/1P 50hrs/2P Higher if set by local board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Documentation Required to Verify HH Composition?</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES If claiming dependent</td>
<td>YES Varies by local dept.</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Does application ask for adult/HH SSN</td>
<td>YES</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES*</td>
<td>YES*</td>
<td>YES*</td>
<td>Unavailable Online</td>
<td>YES*</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Sample of CCDF Policy Guideline Variation by State

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Arkansas</th>
<th>California</th>
<th>Illinois</th>
<th>New York</th>
<th>New Mexico</th>
<th>North Carolina</th>
<th>Texas</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work Hour Requirements</strong></td>
<td>30 hrs/ each adult in the HH</td>
<td>No Minimum</td>
<td>No Minimum</td>
<td>No minimum (Hours of subsidized care tied to hours of work)</td>
<td>5 hrs/month</td>
<td>No Minimum</td>
<td>25hrs/1P 50hrs/2P Higher if set by local board</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Documentation Required to Verify HH Composition?</strong></td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>YES If claiming dependent</td>
<td>YES Varies by local dept.</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
<td>NO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Does application ask for adult/HH SSN</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td>NO</td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
<td>Unavailable Online</td>
<td><strong>YES</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- Guideline may facilitate utilization by Hispanic families
- Guideline may constrain utilization by Hispanic families
A Closer Look at Application Forms
Excerpts of Texas CCDF Application
Excerpts of New Mexico CCDF Application
Implications for Future Studies

• This seven state scan uncovered new aspects of variation in states’ CCDF policy guidelines that may differentially affect Hispanic families.

• Some aspects of CCDF implementation practices that may facilitate and may constrain eligible Hispanic families from applying.

• Whether or not the uncovered variation in policy and practice actually affects CCDF utilization, and other child care and family outcomes, remains an open question.

• The Hispanic Center is engaging in a similar review of state SNAP and TANF guidelines with the aim of synthesizing and mapping the variation to program utilization and outcomes.
Thank you!

Zoelene Hill
Ph.D. Candidate
Sanford School of Public Policy
Duke University
zoelene.hill@duke.edu