Childcare Type and Quality among Subsidy Recipients with and without Special Needs

Amy Susman-Stillman, PhD
Amanda L. Sullivan, PhD, LP
Elyse M. Farnsworth, M.A.

University of Minnesota
Context

- CCDBG Reauthorization
- OPRE interest in special populations
  - Differences in early care and education experiences?
  - Benefits from subsidies equally experienced?
  - Unique considerations?
Young Children with Special Needs

- Developmental Delays
- Congenital Disorders
- Developmental Disabilities
- Chronic Illnesses

Substantial portion of young children are at-risk (Boyle, et al, 2008; Rosenberg, Zhang, & Robinson, 2005)
Why Does *Differential* Use for Young Children with Special Needs Matter?

Poverty + Early Special Needs = Elevated Cumulative Risk

- Educational Attainment
- Mental Health
- Health
- Relationships
- Employment & Earning
- Independent Living
- Criminal Justice Involvement
Consequences of Early Childhood Special Needs

Cost of disability-related treatment and care over lifetime:

$1.5-2.5$ million
Study Framework

Goal/Assumption:
- Subsidy receipt
- ECE access
- High quality care
- Improved family and child outcomes
- Reduced social and fiscal costs of poverty

Current Literature
- High quality ECE beneficial
- Subsidy use increases use of licensed & publicly-funded programs
- Subsidy use increases use of quality (usually centers)
- Subsidy density related to quality care
Unique quality considerations

- **Structural**
  - Adult:child
  - Caregiver knowledge
  - Physical environment, equipment

- **Process**
  - Caregiver-child relationship
  - Intensity of caregiving needs

How do subsidies affect the type and quality of care that families with children with special needs select?
Research Questions

Does type of care for subsidy users differ by special need status?

What types of care are accessed by subsidized children with special needs?

Do subsidized children with special needs spend more time in child care than non-subsidized children with special needs?

What is the quality of care accessed by subsidized children with special needs?
Data Source and Analytic Sample

• Data Source
  – Early Childhood Longitudinal Study – Birth Cohort (ECLS-B)

• Analytic Sample (9 months, 2 years, 4 years)
  – Children eligible for subsidies ranged from 1,498,800 at 9 mo - 1,404,300 at 4 years (weighted; unweighted 4000 (9 mo) -3100 (4 years)
  – Subsample 1: All children using subsidies (weighted N= 163,000 at 9 mo – 101,700 at 4 yrs; unweighted N = 450 at 9 mo - 300 at 4 yrs
  – Subsample 2: Subsidy-eligible children with special needs (weighted N= 81,500 at 9 mo - 344,350 at 4 yrs; unweighted = 450 at 9 mo – 1250 at 4 yrs
Study Variables

Subsidy Eligibility
- Parent reported:
  - Welfare benefits
  - Income 130% of federal poverty level

Subsidy Receipt
- Parent reported receiving subsidy

Special Needs Status
- Parent reported IFSP/IEP;
- Medically diagnosed disability; OR
- Cognitive, motor, or social-emotional functioning 1.5 SD below the mean
Study Variables

Quality Variables

- Environmental quality (ECERS/FDCRS)
- Caregiver:child interactions
- Hours in care
- Caregiver-child interactions (Arnett)
Ecological Predictors of Type & Quality

Child

- Race, Gender

Family

- Maternal Education, Maternal Work Status, Home Language, Marital Status, Number of Siblings, Maternal Age, Receipt of Public Assistance

Geographic

- Urbanicity, Census Region
Does choice of care differ by special need status?

Use of home-based care by special needs status

- 9 mo
- 2 yrs
- 4 yrs

[Bar chart showing the percentage of home-based care usage for 'SN' and 'No SN' across different age groups.]

Department of Educational Psychology & Center for Early Education & Development

University of Minnesota
Does choice of care differ by special needs status

Use of center-based care by special needs status

- SN
- No SN
What Types of Care Are Accessed by Children with Special Needs?

The bar chart shows the distribution of different types of care accessed by children with special needs, categorized by age groups: Infants, Toddlers, and Preschoolers. The types of care are differentiated by whether they are unsubsidized or subsidized, and the settings where care is provided (Home-based, Center-based, Parental-only).

- Infants:
  - Unsubsidized: 30
  - Subsidized: 70
  - Home-based: 40
  - Center-based: 30
  - Parental-only: 30

- Toddlers:
  - Unsubsidized: 40
  - Subsidized: 60
  - Home-based: 50
  - Center-based: 40
  - Parental-only: 50

- Preschoolers:
  - Unsubsidized: 50
  - Subsidized: 50
  - Home-based: 60
  - Center-based: 40
  - Parental-only: 40
What Predicts Use of Home or Center-Based Care by Subsidy-Eligible Children with Special Needs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>9 months</th>
<th>2 years</th>
<th>4 years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1 or more siblings</td>
<td>Home</td>
<td>Center</td>
<td>Home &amp; Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Unmarried parents</td>
<td>Home &amp; Center</td>
<td>Home &amp; Center</td>
<td>Home &amp; Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maternal work status</td>
<td>Home &amp; Center</td>
<td>Home &amp; Center</td>
<td>Home &amp; Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HS or less (v. &gt; HS)</td>
<td>Center</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No healthcare subsidies</td>
<td>Center</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Region</td>
<td>Center (South)</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Gender, race, home language not English, maternal age, use of food subsidies non-significant
Caregiver:Child and Hours of Care

Subsidy-using children with special needs, compared to their non-subsidy-using peers with special needs:

• were more likely to experience caregiver:child that did not meet quality standards

• used more hours of care than non-subsidy-using children with special needs

(all z scores significant at p < .05)
What is the quality of care accessed by subsidized children with special needs?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Higher observed quality care for toddlers</th>
<th>Lower observed quality for preschoolers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Higher child:adult for toddlers &amp; preschoolers</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Less access to quality care for larger families and working parents</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Black children with special needs especially likely to receive poor quality care</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

No consistent improvement in access to quality care
Summary

Without subsidy, parents of children with special needs primarily rely on parental-care only.

Subsidies boost access to home- and center-based care, but toddlers and preschoolers with special needs access home-based care more.

Subsidies do not generally result in access to higher quality care for children with special needs.

Families who are Black, have multiple children, or work more have less access to quality care for their children with special needs.
Implications

- Attention needs to be paid to the quality of care accessed by families with children who have special needs, both on the parent/consumer end and the provider end.
- Family characteristics not necessarily consistent predictors of care for children with special needs.
- Parental underutilization of subsidy because quality is harder to access?
Thank you

For more information, please contact:

Amanda Sullivan, asulliv@umn.edu
Amy Susman-Stillman, asusman@umn.edu

Visit
www.cehd.umn.edu/ceed/projects/subsidyutilization/default.html
CCBDG Allows State Flexibility

- Employment requirements and special allowances
- Provider incentives
- Professional development and collaboration
- Dissemination and coordination
Does choice of care differ by special need status?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>9 months</th>
<th>2 years</th>
<th>4 years</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subsidized</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>special needs</strong></td>
<td>Home-based</td>
<td>Home-based</td>
<td>Home-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Center-based</td>
<td>Center-based</td>
<td>Center-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Subsidized</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>no special needs</strong></td>
<td>Home-based</td>
<td>Home-based</td>
<td>Home-based</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Center-based</td>
<td>Center-based</td>
<td>Center-based</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>