Child Care Stability and Child Development

Taryn Morrissey
American University
Child Care Policy & Research Consortium
October 22, 2010
### Patchworks of Care: A Day in the Life of a Hypothetical 4-year-old

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Time of day</th>
<th>Multiple arrangements</th>
<th>Within-arrangement daily instability at a center</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>8:30am – 11:30am</td>
<td>Morning pre-K program</td>
<td>Morning pre-K teacher, classroom 1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>11:30am – 2:30pm</td>
<td>Grandparents’ home</td>
<td>Afternoon teacher, classroom 2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2:30pm – 5:30pm</td>
<td>Home with babysitter</td>
<td>Second afternoon teacher</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## Patchworks of Care: 7 months in the Lives of 3 Hypothetical 4-year-olds

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Jan</th>
<th>Feb</th>
<th>Mar</th>
<th>Apr</th>
<th>May</th>
<th>Jun</th>
<th>Jul</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child 1</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Grandparent</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Center 1</td>
<td>Center 1</td>
<td>Center 1</td>
<td>Center 2</td>
<td>Center 3</td>
<td>Center 3</td>
<td>Aunt</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child 2</strong></td>
<td>Family care home</td>
<td>Family cc home Pre-K</td>
<td>Pre-K</td>
<td>Pre-K</td>
<td>Pre-K Uncle</td>
<td>Pre-K Center</td>
<td>Center</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Child 3</strong></td>
<td>Center 1 Teacher 1</td>
<td>Center 1 Teacher 1</td>
<td>Center 1 Teacher 2</td>
<td>Center 1 Teacher 3</td>
<td>Center 1 Teacher 3</td>
<td>Center 1 Teacher 3</td>
<td>Center 1 Teacher 4</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# of Nonparental Child Care Arrangements Among Children in NICHD SECCYD

Morrissey, 2009
Combinations of Care Types Among Children in 2 or More Arrangements

Morrissey, 2009

24 months:
- 2 Home-based arrangements: 70%
- 2 Centers: 20%
- Center/Home Combination: 10%

36 months:
- 2 Home-based arrangements: 60%
- 2 Centers: 30%
- Center/Home Combination: 10%

n = 77 for 24 months
n = 134 for 36 months
## Hours in Each Arrangement

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Primary</th>
<th>Secondary</th>
<th>Tertiary</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>24 months</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% 1-5 hrs/wk</td>
<td>31.6 (1 - 96)</td>
<td>12.6 (1 - 61)</td>
<td>3.9 (1 - 16)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>5%</td>
<td>25%</td>
<td>45%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>36 months</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>% 1-5 hrs/wk</td>
<td>30.2 (1 - 80)</td>
<td>10.8 (1 - 99)</td>
<td>8.7 (1 - 60)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>8%</td>
<td>32%</td>
<td>48%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: Mean hours are shown. Ranges are in parentheses. Morrissey, 2009*
Datasets often confound 2 types of child care stability:
- Multiple arrangements (concurrent)
- Long-term stability (over time)

Relatively little is known about:
- Within-arrangement stability, across a day or over time (prevalence or impacts)
- Annual patterns of instability - summer care

Potential selection bias

Morrissey, 2008, 2009
Child Care Instability and Child Development

- **Daily instability**
  - Unpredictable routines, structure, and frequent teacher turnover linked with poorer child well-being and teacher-child interactions (De Schipper et al., 2003)

- **Multiple arrangements**
  - Greater #s of concurrent arrangements linked with poorer child behavior (De Schipper et al., 2004(a), 2004(b); Morrissey, 2009) and cognitive outcomes (Tran & Weinraub, 2006)

- **Long-term instability**
  - Greater #s of arrangements before kindergarten linked with poorer behavior (Loeb et al., 2004; NICHD ECCRN, 1998)
Some evidence that exposure to diverse settings is beneficial for children

- Children whose mothers and child care providers used different control strategies exhibited fewer behavior problems (Erwin et al., 1993)

- Children who experienced high levels of discontinuity in play objects at child care and at home displayed more cooperative social play and autonomy (Provost, 1994)

- Infants and toddlers displayed greater distress but fewer behavior problems immediately following a transition to a new classrooms and caregivers within a single center (Cryer et al., 2005)
Future Research Questions

1. How can we collect better data on child care stability?
2. How can we distinguish planned, developmentally appropriate child care changes/instability from unintentional or unpredictable changes?
3. Does the intentionality and predictability of child care changes moderate the effects of child care instability on child development?
4. What mechanisms underlie the links between child care instability and child development?
5. How do child and family characteristics moderate the impacts of child care stability?
6. How has the current economic downturn affect child care stability, and child well-being?
7. What policy changes can better support stability from the child’s perspective?