Early Learning Guidelines (ELGs) describe expectations about what children should know (understand) and do (competencies and skills) across different domains of learning.¹ In 2002, President Bush's Good Start, Grow Smart early learning initiative asked States to develop voluntary guidelines on literacy, language, pre-reading, and numeracy activities for children ages three to five that align with State K-12 standards.² Since then, every State has developed and published these ELGs for preschool-age children. In addition, several States and Territories have developed ELGs for children birth to three, creating a continuum of guidelines from birth to five. States and Territories are at varying stages of the development process of ELGs for infants and toddlers – convening task forces or work groups to begin discussions, reviewing draft guidelines, or evaluating and revising existing ones. This publication describes existing infant/toddler ELG initiatives, and is intended as a resource for States and Territories as they develop and/or revise their own guidelines for infants and toddlers.

Published by the National Infant & Toddler Child Care Initiative @ ZERO TO THREE under the direction of the Child Care Bureau, Office of Family Assistance, Administration for Children and Families, U.S. Department of Health and Human Services.

This paper is published for information purposes only. No official endorsement of any practice, publication, or individual by the Department of Health and Human Services, Administration for Children and Families is intended or should be inferred.
As of November 2006, 13 States and one Territory had published ELGs for infants and toddlers: Arkansas, Delaware, Florida, Georgia, Iowa, Kentucky, Louisiana, Maryland, Nebraska, New Hampshire, Ohio, Tennessee, Washington, and Puerto Rico. An additional four States and two Territories had draft versions available for review: Commonwealth of the Northern Mariana Islands (CNMI), Connecticut, Guam, Maine, Michigan, and Minnesota. In developing this publication, we analyzed all of these ELGs, but the examples cited come solely from the final, published documents. The examples presented here are by no means exhaustive. Rather, they provide a sampling of the information that is available in the published ELGs for infants and toddlers.

There is no general guidance for birth to three ELGs at this time, and States’ initial efforts have varied widely in content and format. This variation makes it difficult to make direct comparisons among the documents. We have analyzed the documents as a group to summarize the types of information they contain and how the material is presented. This analysis examines the structure and content of the ELGs, how issues of diversity and inclusion are addressed, the degree to which research and practice are connected, and the appropriateness of the documents for the identified target audience(s).

Structure of the Documents

The majority of ELGs for infants and toddlers cover children from birth through age three, with indicators provided for specified age groups within this range. A few States include ELGs for older children in the same document. Among those ELGs that focus solely on ages birth to three, several States use the same four age groups: birth to 8 months; 8 to 18 months; 18 to 24 months; 24 to 36 months. Ohio’s Infant & Toddler Guidelines employ three overlapping age ranges: birth-8 months, 6-18 months, and 16-36 months to emphasize the fluidity of early development. Most of the ELG documents emphasize this notion of a developmental continuum across age groups. For example, a statement in Georgia’s Early Learning Standards: Birth Through Age advises: “Be aware that children develop at different rates, and the age groups should be seen as flexible. It is best to view the standards as a continuum across the age groups.” Many of the documents include information about how the ELGs are aligned with the State’s standards for three to five year old children and/or K-12 standards. Some are also aligned with other standards, such as Head Start Performance Standards and licensing regulations.

Content of ELGs for Infants and Toddlers

The first three years of life are a time of remarkable growth during which infants and toddlers develop emotional security and basic mental processes in the context...
of relationships, such as the ability to focus, to maintain attention, to persist in their efforts through frustration, and to communicate and discern language. These processes lay the foundation for all future learning. Infant and toddler ELGs consider the uniqueness of this period of development and reflect the progression of learning in the first three years. Since infants and toddlers learn within the context of the relationships and environments provided by the adults in their lives, ELGs would also be expected to recognize relationships as a primary learning context during this period. Since it is often not developmentally appropriate to try to measure the progress of an infant or toddler in terms of the mastery of specific skills, it may not be suitable for these ELGs to be directly linked to specific learning objectives and associated instructional strategies.

Most of the ELGs are organized around key developmental domains. The number of domains presented in the ELGs ranges between four and seven. Many of the documents reference the four developmental domains identified by the National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC): physical, social, emotional, and cognitive. Several States further specify topic areas, such as language, literacy, creative arts, science and/or mathematics. Many of the ELGs also include a domain that addresses how young children obtain knowledge – this domain is often called “Approaches to Learning.”

While most of the ELGs define each domain, the level of detail in these definitions varies from State to State and a few do not define the terms at all.

Most ELGs also recognize that while development is sequential (e.g. children learn to crawl before walking), it occurs at different rates for each child. For example, from the introduction to Arkansas’ Framework for Infant and Toddler Care: “Infants and toddlers are born ready to learn. This learning normally takes place in a predictable sequence. However, there can be a wide range of attainment of developmental milestones from one child to another, for each has his or her own timetable.”

Most of the ELGs address learning processes, including the important ways that curiosity and exploration help young children acquire knowledge. For example, from New Hampshire’s Early Learning Guidelines: “From infancy, learning is a process of encountering problems and inventing solutions...Even the youngest infants and toddlers are motivated by curiosity and interest to explore their environments.”

Many States include these elements when defining the domains, especially those that identify “Approaches to Learning” as a domain.

Discussions of the physical environment often emphasize the need for young
children to be able to freely explore their surroundings, and for the environment to be stimulating and developmentally appropriate. For example, from Arkansas’ Framework for Infant and Toddler Care: “Caregivers support children's play, exploration and experimentation with their environment...An environment is provided that is rich in experiences and materials that children can explore with all their senses, thus promoting optimal development in all areas”.13

As noted previously, it is often neither feasible nor appropriate to try to measure the progress of an infant or toddler in terms of the mastery of specific skills. Accordingly, unlike ELGs for preschool children, most ELGs for infants and toddlers are not directly linked to specific learning objectives and associated instructional strategies. While a few of the ELGs do focus primarily on what children may achieve within the scope of each domain, most of the documents also include information about how caregivers can support young children's development in each domain. For example, although Florida's Birth to Three Learning and Developmental Standards are written in terms of children's behaviors and accomplishments, it also includes two important elements – definitions of the domains and the “Questions to Ask Yourself” – that focus on the role of the caregiver.14 Similarly, New Hampshire's Early Learning Guidelines include questions for adults to consider that help them link the guidelines to their day-to-day practice and experiences.15

Many ELGs include indicators and examples for both children and caregivers. Delaware's Infant and Toddler Early Learning Foundations provides examples of children's behavior using the heading “Baby/Toddler/Child May...” and caregiver's behavior using the heading “Caregiver Can...” for each domain.16 Maryland’s Guidelines for Healthy Child Development and Care for Young Children (Birth - Three Years of Age) presents tips for parents as well.17

Some ELGs also include examples or vignettes written from a young child's perspective. For example, Ohio's Infant & Toddler Guidelines identify a key developmental focus for each of three age groups. describing it from the child's perspective. Here is an excerpt from the definition of security, the identified focus for children from birth to eight months: “During the early days and months of my life, I am primarily focused on security. In essence, I am learning about what I can expect from life. When I feel discomfort, I cry. Someone comes to help me...I feel great knowing she is with me when I need her. All of this is very important! I have to feel emotionally secure in order to have the confidence to learn new things.”18

Embracing Diversity

Inclusiveness. Children develop at varying paces, especially in the first three years of life, and this variability may be more pronounced when a child has special needs, due

---

**Benchmarks**

“Benchmarks should recognize ALL children as capable of learning, achieving, and making developmental progress regardless of their physical/ emotional conditions, backgrounds, or experiences. A universal set of benchmarks should be developed for all children regardless of cultural and economic differences, presenting disabilities, and physical and learning challenges. The benchmarks should take into consideration this diversity and make accommodations for the unique nature of each child’s learning and development.”

(Washington State Early Learning and Development Benchmarks, p.7)
to the impact of the disability or delay on development in one or more domains. Given the integrated nature of development, the presence of an identified special need in one domain will often affect other aspects of that child’s development as well. With consideration for the developmental challenges of children with special needs, ELGs can be inclusive by describing the overarching developmental process and expectations for typically developing children, while allowing for individualization in how (and when) achievement is described and measured. ELGs can also provide information and resources to caregivers to help them support the development of all of the children in their care, including those with special needs.

Some States utilize universal design in developing their guidelines, involving expert review of the ELGs to ensure that the language used to identify and describe young children’s knowledge, competencies, skills, and behaviors is as inclusive of children with disabilities or other special needs as possible. One of the most comprehensive ELGs in terms of inclusion is Nebraska’s *Early Learning Guidelines for Ages Birth through 3*, which contains an introductory section on “Supporting Inclusive Learning Environments.” Each of its seven developmental domain sections also details several strategies for supporting such environments. Other ELGs such as Iowa’s *Early Learning Standards* and Georgia’s *Early Learning Standards: Birth through Age Three* include extended discussions about the importance of including children with disabilities and highlight strategies for accomplishing this goal. Among the ELGs that include illustrative examples, some of these documents describe how a child with a disability may function (e.g., an example on verbal communication that includes a child signing a word in American Sign Language). The focus on inclusiveness varies among States. Some ELGs include photos of children with disabilities or note in their introductions that the document is inclusive of all children, but do not refer to children with special needs in the guidelines themselves.

**The role of culture.** The culture of children and their families plays a key role in their development. ELGs can address the ways in which adults can support each child within his or her cultural context. Most of the ELGs explicitly address cultural issues. For example, Florida’s *Standards* state: “Each child is part of a family that is rooted in a cultural system of beliefs, values, attitudes, practices, and language that create a shared sense of meaning that is reflected in behaviors, daily routines, and customs...To understand children’s behavior and parents’ expectations, caregivers and teachers must be aware of their own culture, show respect for other cultures, learn intercultural communication skills, work in partnership with parents, and plan for diversity as a critical component of the program.” Efforts can also be made to use culturally diverse examples and words in the guidelines.
In Washington's Early Learning and Development Benchmarks, each domain description includes a section on how considerations of cultural diversity can be supported. Nebraska's Guidelines illustrate ways that an adult’s understanding and recognition of a child's culture can enhance that child’s learning experience: “Attributes such as language, culture, values, and beliefs are part of the children’s early experiences in the family setting and provide the basis for learning throughout life...the early childhood setting supports the family by incorporating the child’s home language and culture as much as possible. Words, foods, care practices, music and objects that are familiar to the child provide a greater sense of comfort. These increased feelings of safety and security make it possible for learning to occur more readily.”

Some ELGs include only a brief mention of the impact of culture on young children's development or discuss culture only in the context of language and literacy. However, many of the States weave cultural issues throughout their documents. For example, several of Iowa's Standards’ “Examples of Benchmarks” involve children's exposure to different cultures and children reading and singing in different languages. Many States use culturally diverse children's names and include photos that depict children from diverse racial and ethnic backgrounds. In addition, some ELGs address children's knowledge and understanding of culturally-based social rules such as formal address or informal address. In addition, many of the ELGs include sections on how to support children and families whose home language is not English.

Connecting Research and Practice

ELGs should be grounded in current research about infant and toddler development. This means that research should inform the content of the guidelines, and direct connections are made between what is known from the research and how adults can use that information to support young children's development. For example, Kentucky’s Building a Strong Foundation for School Success: Kentucky’s Early Childhood Standards clearly describes the research on which the Standards are based, citing a variety of studies on the effects of early experiences on the child’s development.

While most of the published ELGs for infants and toddlers do cite current research, the degree to which the guidelines are actually grounded in that research varies considerably. Many documents make reference to what research teaches us about development without connecting that information to what adults can do on a day-to-day basis to support the healthy development of young children. Since those documents that heavily cite research or use extensive references tend to be rather dense and difficult to read, it is very important that research findings are explained in clear, simple language.
In some cases, the ELGs are extensively research-based but the final product does not reflect the breadth and depth of research that went into its development. For example, during the development process of Ohio’s *Infant & Toddler Guidelines*, evidence was cited for each guideline and example, including some normative data from developmental assessments. However, in order to make the *Guidelines* readable for as wide an audience as possible, these citations were not embedded in the guidelines and examples of the final document.\(^\text{27}\)

**Appropriateness for Target Audiences**

ELGs for infants and toddlers need to be clear and meaningful so caregivers and parents can use them to actively support and guide children’s development and learning.\(^\text{28}\) Such guidelines can assist caregivers in understanding the effects of a stimulating and engaging environment on children’s learning. Most of the ELGs clearly identify the target audiences in the introductory section of the document. In most cases, the audiences include parents, early care and education providers, and other caregivers. Some State identify additional audiences, such as early childhood higher education instructors or policymakers. By contrast, a few do not explicitly identify their audience.

Challenges exist in States’ attempts to make Infant/Toddler ELGs for infants and toddlers appropriate and accessible to their target audiences. In almost every case, even where there was an explicit effort to use simple, easily understood language, the ELGs require a higher reading level than might be expected of many parents and possibly caregivers, especially those for whom English is not their first language. Many States use colorful graphics and attractive layouts to make the ELGs more visually appealing. Unfortunately, these graphics did not substantially compensate for the language level, so the information remained too complex for effective communication with the defined target audiences.

An additional factor that makes many of the ELGs inappropriate for parents and caregivers is the length – several are more than 100 pages long. Even if they are colorful and well-written, the sheer length of such documents would likely intimidate the target audience(s). There are several strategies to address these issues. A few States, such as Kentucky, have created separate, shorter publications that summarize the information for parents and caregivers. Iowa and Nebraska limited the length of each guideline to two pages and other States, such as Delaware and Ohio, present the guidelines in poster-style format.

**Conclusion**

When creating ELGs for infants and toddlers, it is important to take into account the many ways that development occurs during the first three years of life. By
directing attention to how infants and toddlers function emotionally and socially as they build knowledge and competencies, States and Territories have an opportunity to emphasize the components of quality caregiving environments that create confident, curious lifelong learners. ELGs that are developmentally appropriate, inclusive of all children, culturally sensitive, research-based, and effectively communicated for target audiences will help to ensure that infants and toddlers receive appropriate support from the adults who care for them.

When adults understand what to expect from children during their first three years and how to support their development during this time, they can better nurture the skills needed for success in school and in life. Developmentally appropriate ELGs for infants and toddlers can be an effective tool to help achieve these goals.

3 The published ELGs for infants and toddlers are summarized in the table at the end of this document. As of November 2006, Puerto Rico had also published ELGs for infants and toddlers, which are available only in Spanish. Since the National Infant & Toddler Child Care Initiative is in the process of translating Puerto Rico’s ELGs into English, those guidelines have not yet been analyzed.
4 As of November 2006, California’s ELGs for infants and toddlers were not available for review.
5 Some States and Territories are using one or more of the published ELGs as models for their own guidelines – for example, Guam’s draft ELGs were adapted and developed from Maryland’s Guidelines for Healthy Child Development and Care for Young Children (Birth - Three Years of Age).
6 The following State ELGs cover a wider age range: Iowa (birth through age five), Kentucky (birth through age four), New Hampshire (birth through age five), Tennessee (birth through age five), and Washington (birth through kindergarten).

12 Approaches to Learning in ELGs for preschoolers are often defined or presented as learned dispositions. For the birth to three period, in contrast, Approaches to Learning are often described as innate. With infants, temperament traits can be confused with behaviors that are sometimes labeled as Approaches to Learning in older children, for example, persistence or distractibility. This is one of the reasons that it is critical for caregivers to understand the role that factors such as temperament play in young children’s developmental functioning.


17 [Maryland] Guidelines for Healthy Child Development and Care for Young Children (Birth - Three Years of Age). Available at: http://www.dhr.state.md.us/cca/pdfs/guidechild.pdf


20 Nebraska Early Learning Guidelines for Ages Birth to 3. Available at: http://www.nde.state.ne.us/ech/ELGuidelines/ELG_IT.pdf

21 Iowa Early Learning Standards. Available at: http://www.iowa.gov/educate/3-to-5-years-old/early-childhood-standards_3.html


23 Washington State Early Learning and Development Benchmarks. Available at: http://www.k12.wa.us/EarlyLearning/Benchmarks.aspx

24 Nebraska Early Learning Guidelines for Ages Birth to 3 (page 4). Available at: http://www.nde.state.ne.us/ech/ELGuidelines/ELG_IT.pdf


27 Ohio’s Infant & Toddler Guidelines. Available at: http://jfs.ohio.gov/CDC/InfantToddler.pdf

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name of the Document</th>
<th>Age Range Covered and Age Groups</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Arkansas Framework for Infant and Toddler Care</strong>&lt;br&gt; <a href="http://www.arkansas.gov/childcare/bench.pdf">http://www.arkansas.gov/childcare/bench.pdf</a></td>
<td>The Framework covers birth to age three. No age groups are specified. There is a separate document for three and four year olds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Delaware Infant and Toddler Early Learning Foundations: A Curriculum Framework</strong>&lt;br&gt; <a href="http://www.doe.k12.de.us/files/pdf/earlychildhood_infant-toddler.pdf">http://www.doe.k12.de.us/files/pdf/earlychildhood_infant-toddler.pdf</a></td>
<td>The Foundations cover birth to age three. They are divided into three age groups: Infant (birth to 9 months), Early Toddler (9 to 18 months), Late Toddler (18 to 36 months)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Florida Birth to Three Learning and Developmental Standards</strong>&lt;br&gt; <a href="http://www.floridajobs.org/earlylearning/downloads/pdf/birth_to_3book.pdf">http://www.floridajobs.org/earlylearning/downloads/pdf/birth_to_3book.pdf</a></td>
<td>The Standards cover birth through age three. They are divided into four age ranges: Birth to 8 months, 8 to 18 months, 18 to 24 months, 24 to 36 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Georgia Early Learning Standards: Birth Through Age 3</strong>&lt;br&gt; <a href="http://www.decal.state.ga.us/CCS/CCSServices.aspx?Header=67&amp;SubHeader=&amp;Position=18&amp;HeaderName=Georgia%20Early%20Learning%20Standards">http://www.decal.state.ga.us/CCS/CCSServices.aspx?Header=67&amp;SubHeader=&amp;Position=18&amp;HeaderName=Georgia%20Early%20Learning%20Standards</a></td>
<td>The Standards cover birth through age three. They are divided into four age groups: Infant (birth to 12 months), One Year Olds (12 to 24 months), Two Year Olds (24 to 36 months), Three Year Olds (36 to 48 months)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Iowa Early Learning Standards</strong>&lt;br&gt; <a href="http://www.iowa.gov/educate/3-to-5years-old/early-childhood-standards_3.html">http://www.iowa.gov/educate/3-to-5years-old/early-childhood-standards_3.html</a></td>
<td>The Standards cover birth to age five. They are divided into two categories: Infants &amp; Toddlers, Preschool. The age groups are not specified beyond the use of these terms.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Kentucky's Early Childhood Standards</strong>&lt;br&gt; <a href="http://www.education.ky.gov/KDE/Instructional+Resources/Early+Childhood+Development/Building+a+Strong+Foundation+for+School+Success+Series.htm">http://www.education.ky.gov/KDE/Instructional+Resources/Early+Childhood+Development/Building+a+Strong+Foundation+for+School+Success+Series.htm</a></td>
<td>The Standards cover birth through age four. They are divided into two age groups: Birth to age 3, Age 3 through age 4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Louisiana's Early Learning Guidelines and Program Standards: Birth through Three</strong>&lt;br&gt; <a href="http://www.dss.state.la.us/Documents/OFS/LAEarlyLearningGuide.pdf">http://www.dss.state.la.us/Documents/OFS/LAEarlyLearningGuide.pdf</a></td>
<td>The Standards cover birth through age three. There are four age groups: Young Infants (birth to 8 months), Mobile Infants (8 to 18 months), Toddlers (18 to 24 months), Twos (24 to 36 months). An additional section presents Guidelines for three-year-olds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name of the Document</td>
<td>Age Range Covered and Age Groups</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>---------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Maryland’s Guidelines for Healthy Child Development and Care for Young Children (Birth - Three Years of Age)</em> <em>(<a href="http://www.dhr.state.md.us/cca/pdfs/guidechild.pdf">http://www.dhr.state.md.us/cca/pdfs/guidechild.pdf</a>)</em></td>
<td><em>The Guidelines</em> cover birth through three. They are divided into eight age groups: Birth to 4 months: 5 to 8 months, 9 to 12 months, 13 to 18 months, 19 to 24 months, 24 to 30 months, 30 months to 3 years, 3 years</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Nebraska Early Learning Guidelines for Ages Birth to 3</em> <em>(<a href="http://www.nde.state.ne.us/ech/ELGuidelines/ELG_IT.pd">http://www.nde.state.ne.us/ech/ELGuidelines/ELG_IT.pd</a>)</em></td>
<td><em>The Guidelines</em> cover birth to age three. They are divided into two age groups: Infants (birth to 18 months), Toddlers (18 months to 3 years)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>New Hampshire Early Learning Guidelines</em> <em>(<a href="http://www.dhhs.nh.gov/DHHS/CDB/LIBRARY/Policy-Guideline/learning-guidelines.htm">http://www.dhhs.nh.gov/DHHS/CDB/LIBRARY/Policy-Guideline/learning-guidelines.htm</a>)</em></td>
<td><em>The Guidelines</em> cover birth through age five. They are divided into two categories: Infants and Toddlers, Preschoolers. The age groups are not specified beyond the use of these terms</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Ohio’s Infant &amp; Toddler Guidelines</em> <em>(<a href="http://jfs.ohio.gov/CDC/InfantToddler.pdf">http://jfs.ohio.gov/CDC/InfantToddler.pdf</a>)</em></td>
<td><em>The Guidelines</em> cover birth through age three. They are divided into three overlapping age ranges: Birth to 8 months, 6 to 18 months, 16 to 36 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Tennessee Early Learning Developmental Standards</em> <em>(<a href="http://www.state.tn.us/education/ci/standards/earlychildhood/">http://www.state.tn.us/education/ci/standards/earlychildhood/</a>)</em></td>
<td><em>The Standards</em> cover birth to age five. They are divided into nine age groups: Birth through 4 months, 5 through 8 months, 9 through 12 months, 13 through 18 months, 19 through 24 months, 25 through 30 months, 31 through 36 months, 37 through 48 months, 49 through 60 months</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Washington State Early Learning and Development Benchmarks</em> <em>(<a href="http://www.k12.wa.us/EarlyLearning/Benchmarks.aspx">http://www.k12.wa.us/EarlyLearning/Benchmarks.aspx</a>)</em></td>
<td><em>The Benchmarks</em> cover birth to Kindergarten. They are divided into four age groups: Birth to 18 months, 18 to 36 months, 36 to 60 months, 60 to Kindergarten</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>